IN THE CIRCUIT COURT OF THE ELEVENTH JUDICIAL CIRCUIT IN AND FOR DADE COUNTY, FLORIDA

GENERAL JURISDICTION DIVISION CASE NO 94-08273 CA-22

HOWARD A ENGLE, M.D., et. al.,

Plaintiffs,

V

RI REYNOLDS TOBACCO COMPANY,

et al.,

Defendants

/

VERDICT FORM FOR PHASE I

We, the Jury, return the following Verdict:

Ouestion No 1

[Generic Causation]

Does smoking cigarettes cause one or more of the following diseases or medical conditions?

Aortic Aneurysm	Yes	. No
Asthmatic Bronchitis, as related to COPD	Yes	No <u>~</u>
Bladder Cancer	Yes	No
Cerebrovascular Disease (including Stroke)	Yes	No
Cervical Cancer	Yes	No
Chronic Obstructive Pulmonary Disease-COPD	_	
(including Emphysema)	Yes	No
Coronary Heart Disease		
(including cardiovascular disease, hardening	3	
of the arteries, atherosclerosis, coronary		
artery disease and arteriosclerosis, angina,		
abnormal blood clotting, blood vessel dama	ge,	
myocardial infarction (heart attack))	Yes	No
Esophageal (Throat) Cancer	Yes V	No
Infertility	Yes	No V

Kidney Cancer	Yes No,
Laryngeal (Throat or Voice Box) Cancer	Yes No No
Lung Cancer	Yes No
Adenocarcinoma	Yes No
Bronchioloalveolar carcinoma	Yes No
Large cell carcinoma	Yes No
Small cell carcinoma	Yes No No
Squamous cell carcinoma	Yes No No
Complications of Pregnancy (miscarriage)	Yes No
Oral Cavity/Tongue Cancer	Yes No
Pancreatic Cancer	Yes No
Peripheral Vascular Disease	,
(including Buerger's Disease)	Yes No
Pharyngeal Cancer	Yes No
Stomach Cancer	Yes No No
Question No 2 [Addiction/Dependence] Are cigarettes that contain nicotine addictiv	e or dependence producing?
-	Yes No
	103110
Question No 3.	
[Strict Liability]	
Did one or more of the Defendant Tobacco of market that were defective and unreasonably dangerous?	• •
Please answer "Yes" or "No" as to each Defendants, please answer whether the conduct occurred periods:	•
Philip Morris, Incorporated	Vac I No
· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	Vac No
Before July 1, 1974 After July 1, 1974	Yes No Yes No Yes No
Atter July 1, 1974	1 62 NO

	Both before and after July 1, 1974	Yes	No
RJ Revnolds T	obacco Company	Yes	No
•	Before July 1, 1974	Yes	
	After July 1, 1974	Yes	
	Both before and after July 1, 1974	Yes V	No
Dag 8. 11711	Takasa Camania	V /	Na
Brown & Will	amson Tobacco Corporation	Yes	
	Before July 1, 1974	Yes	No
	After July 1, 1974	Yes	No
	Both before and after July 1, 1974	Yes	No
Brown & Will	iamson Tobacco Corporation, as	_	
	merican Tobacco Company	Yes	No
	Before July 1, 1974	Yes	
	After July 1, 1974	Yes	
	Both before and after July 1, 1974	Yes	No
Lorillard Toba	cco Company/Lorillard, Inc	Yes	No
201111111111111111111111111111111111111	Before July 1, 1974	Yes	
	After July 1, 1974		
	• • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • •	Yes	No
	Both before and after July 1, 1974	Yes	NO
Liggett Group	, Inc	Yes	No
	Before July 1, 1974	Yes	
	After July 1, 1974	Yes	
	Both before and after July 1, 1974	Yes	No
Brooke Groun	I tod. Inc.	Vac I	No
Brooke Group		Yes	
	Before July 1, 1974	Yes	
	After July 1, 1974	Yes	
	Both before and after July 1, 1974	Yes	No

Ouestion No 4

[Fraud and Misrepresentation]

Did one or more of the Defendants make a false statement of a material fact, either knowing the statement was false or misleading, or being without knowledge as to its truth or falsity, with the intention of misleading smokers?

Please answer "Yes" or "No" as to each Defendant, below. If you answer "yes" to any Defendants, please answer whether the conduct occurred during one of the following time periods

Philip Morris,	Incorporated	Yes	No
	Before May 5, 1982	Yes	No
	After May 5, 1982	Yes	
	Both before and after May 5, 1982	Yes	No
RI Remolds T	obacco Company	Yes	No
10 Reynolds 1	Before May 5, 1982		
		Yes	
	After May 5, 1982	Yes	
	Both before and after May 5, 1982	Yes	No
Brown & Will	iamson Tobacco Corporation	Yes	No
	Before May 5, 1982	Yes	No
	After May 5, 1982		
	Both before and after May 5, 1982	Yes	No
	amson Tobacco Corporation, as	_	
successor to A	merican Tobacco Company	Yes	No
	Before May 5, 1982	Yes	
	After May 5, 1982	Yes	
	Both before and after May 5, 1982		
Lorillard Toba	cco Company/Lorillard, Inc.	Yes	No
201111416 1004	Before May 5, 1982	Yes	
	After May 5, 1982		
	Doth before and after Mary 5, 1002	Yes	No
	Both before and after May 5, 1982	i es L	140
Liggett Group	, Inc.	Yes	No
	Before May 5, 1982	Yes	
	After May 5, 1982	Yes	No

	Both before and after May 5, 1982	Yes	No
Brooke Group	. Ltd . Inc	Yes	No
•	Before May 5, 1982	Yes	No
	After May 5, 1982	Yes	No
	Both before and after May 5, 1982	Yes	
Council for To	obacco Research-U.S.A	Yes	No
	Before May 5, 1982	Yes	No
	After May 5, 1982		
	Both before and after May 5, 1982	Yes Yes	No
Tobacco Instit	tute	Yes	No
	Before May 5, 1982	Yes	No
	After May 5, 1982	Yes	No
	Both before and after May 5, 1982	Yes Yes	No
	Question No 4a		
	[Fraud by Concealment]		
otherwise known or availab	ore of the Defendants conceal or on ole, knowing the material was false a cerning or proving the health effect	and misleadi	ng, or failed to
Please	answer "Yes" or "No" as to each Def	endant, belov	v. If you answer
	ase answer whether the conduct occur		•
Philip Morris,	Incorporated	Yes	No
	Before May 5, 1982	Yes	No
	After May 5, 1982	Yes	No
	Both before and after May 5, 1982	Yes	No
RJ Reynolds T	Tobacco Company	Yes V	No
•	Before May 5, 1982	Yes	No
	After May 5, 1982	Yes	No
	Both before and after May 5, 1982	Yes	No
Brown & Will	liamson Tobacco Corporation	Yes	No

CASE NO 94-08273 CA-22

	Before May 5, 1982	Yes	No
	After May 5, 1982	Yes	No
	Both before and after May 5, 1982		No
Brown & Will	iamson Tobacco Corporation, as		
	American Tobacco Company	Yes !	No
	Before May 5, 1982	Yes	
	After May 5, 1982	Yes	No
	Both before and after May 5, 1982	Yes V	
Lorillard Toba	acco Company/Lorillard, Inc	Yes	No
	Before May 5, 1982	Yes	
	After May 5, 1982	Yes	
	Both before and after May 5, 1982		
Liggett Group) Inc	Yes _ L	No
	Before May 5, 1982	Yes	No
	After May 5, 1982	Yes	
	Both before and after May 5, 1982		No
Brooke Group	o I td. Inc	Yes <u></u>	No
Dioone Cioup	Before May 5, 1982	Yes	
	After May 5, 1982	Yes V	
	Both before and after May 5, 1982		
Council for To	obacco Research-U.S.A.	Yes _	No
	Before May 5, 1982	Yes	No
	After May 5, 1982	Yes	
	Both before and after May 5, 1982	Yes L	
Tobacco Insti	tute	Yes	No
	Before May 5, 1982	Yes	
	After May 5, 1982	Ves	No
	Both before and after May 5, 1982	Yes V	No
	Dom botolo and arror may 3, 1702	· C3	• • •

Ouestion No 5

[Civil Conspiracy-Misrepresentation]

Did two or more of the Defendants enter into an agreement to misrepresent information relating to the health effects of cigarette smoking, or the addictive nature of smoking cigarettes, with the intention that smokers and members of the public rely to their detriment?

Please answer "Yes" or "No" as to each Defendant, below:

Philip Morris, Incorporated RJ Reynolds Tobacco Company	Yes No No No No
Brown & Williamson Tobacco Corporation	Yes No
Brown & Williamson Tobacco Corporation as	<u>,</u>
successor to American Tobacco Company	Yes No
Lorillard Tobacco Company/Lorillard, Inc.	Yes No
Liggett Group, Inc.	Yes No No
Brooke Group, Ltd., Inc	Yes No
Council for Tobacco Research-U.S A	Yes No
Tobacco Institute	Yes No

Question No 5a

[Civil Conspiracy-Concealment]

Did two or more of the Defendants enter into an agreement to conceal or omit information regarding the health effects of cigarette smoking, or the addictive nature of smoking cigarettes, with the intention that smokers and members of the public rely to their detriment?

Please answer "Yes" or "No" as to each Defendant, below:

Philip Morris, Incorporated	Yes No
RJ Reynolds Tobacco Company	Yes No
Brown & Williamson Tobacco Corporation	Yes No
Brown & Williamson Tobacco Corporation as	
successor to American Tobacco Company	Yes No
Lorillard Tobacco Company/Lorillard, Inc.	Yes No
Liggett Group, Inc.	Yes No
Brooke Group, Ltd., Inc.	Yes No

Yes No No No

	Council for Tobacco Research-U S A Tobacco Institute	Yes Yes	No
	Question No 6.		
	[Breach of Implied Warranty]		
cigarettes the	Did one or more of the Defendant Tobacco Com at were defective in that they were not reasonably	•	
"yes" to any l	Please answer "Yes" or "No" as to each Def Defendants, please answer whether the conduct occu e periods		•
	Philip Morris, Incorporated Before July 1, 1969 July 1, 1969 thru July 1, 1974 After July 1, 1974	Yes Yes Yes Yes	No No No
	RJ Reynolds Tobacco Company Before July 1, 1969 July 1, 1969 thru July 1, 1974 After July 1, 1974	Yes Yes Yes Yes	No No No
	Brown & Williamson Tobacco Corporation Before July 1, 1969 July 1, 1969 thru July 1, 1974 After July 1, 1974	Yes Yes Yes Yes	No No No
, *	Brown & Williamson Tobacco Corporation, as successor to American Tobacco Company Before July 1, 1969 July 1, 1969 thru July 1, 1974 After July 1, 1974	Yes Yes Yes Yes	No No No
٠	Lorillard Tobacco Company/Lorillard, Inc. Before July 1, 1969 July 1, 1969 thru July 1, 1974 After July 1, 1974	Yes Yes Yes	No No No No

Liggett Group, Inc.
Before July 1, 1969

July 1, 1969 thru July 1, 1974 After July 1, 1974	Yes No No
Brooke Group, Ltd , Inc	Yes No No
Before July 1, 1969	Yes No
July 1, 1969 thru July 1, 1974	Yes No
After July 1, 1974	Yes No No

Question No 7.

[Breach of Express Warranty]

Did one or more of the Defendant Tobacco Companies sell or supply cigarettes that, at the time of sale or supply, did not conform to representations of fact made by said Defendant(s), either orally or in writing?

Please answer "Yes" or "No" as to each Defendant, below. If you answer "yes" to any Defendants, please answer whether the conduct occurred during one of the following time periods

Philip Morris, Incorporated	Yes No No
Before July 1, 1974	Yes No
After July 1, 1974	Yes No
Both before and after J	
RJ Reynolds Tobacco Company	Yes No No
Before July 1, 1974	Yes No
After July 1, 1974	Yes No
Both before and after J	
Brown & Williamson Tobacco Corpor	ration Yes No
Before July 1, 1974	Yes No
After July 1, 1974	Yes No
Both before and after J	the state of the s
Brown & Williamson Tobacco Corpor	ration, as
successor to American Tobacco Comp	pany Yes No No
Before July 1, 1974	Yes No
After July 1, 1974	Yes No
Both before and after J	.45
Lorillard Tobacco Company/Lorillard	, Inc. Yes No No

CASE NO 94-08273 CA-22

to

	After July 1, 1974 After July 1, 1974 Both before and after July 1, 1974	Yes Yes	No No No
Liggett Group	, Inc Before July 1, 1974 After July 1, 1974 Both before and after July 1, 1974	Yes Yes Yes Yes	No
Brooke Group	Before July 1, 1974 After July 1, 1974 Both before and after July 1, 1974	Yes Yes Yes Yes	No
	Question No 8		
	[Negligence]		
_	s proven that one or more of the Detailed the degree of care which a reason rcumstances?		
	"Yes" or "No" as to each Defendant, er whether the conduct occurred duri	-	
Philip Morris,	Incorporated Before July 1, 1969 After July 1, 1969 Both before and after July 1, 1969	Yes Yes Yes Yes	No No
RJ Reynolds T	Obacco Company Before July 1, 1969 After July 1, 1969 Both before and after July 1, 1969	Yes Yes Yes	No No
Brown & Will	iamson Tobacco Corporation Before July 1, 1969 After July 1, 1969 Both before and after July 1, 1969	Yes Yes Yes	No No

Brown & Williamson Tobacco Corporation, as

Question No 9.

[Intentional Infliction of Emotional Distress]

Have Plaintiffs proven that one or more of the Defendant Tobacco Companies engaged in extreme and outrageous conduct or with reckless disregard relating to cigarettes sold or supplied to Florida smokers with the intent to inflict severe emotional distress?

Please answer "Yes" or "No" as to each Defendant, below:

Yes No
Yes No
Yes No
4
Yes No
Yes No
Yes No
Yes No No

Kenthon Krithway Franciscon FOREFERSON LEIGHTON ANTHONY FINEGAN

Question No 10

[Entitlement to Punitive Damages]

Under the circumstances of this case, state below whether the conduct of any Defendant rose to a level that would permit a potential award or entitlement to punitive damages.

Please answer "Yes" or "No" as to each Defendant, below

Philip Morris, Incorporated	Yes No
RJ Reynolds Tobacco Company	Yes No
Brown & Williamson Tobacco Corporation	Yes No No
Brown & Williamson Tobacco Corporation as	
successor to American Tobacco Company	Yes No
Lorillard Tobacco Company/Lorillard, Inc	Yes No
Liggett Group, Inc.	Yes No
Brooke Group, Ltd., Inc.	Yes No
Council for Tobacco Research-U.S.A	Yes No
Tobacco Institute	Yes No

SO SAY WE ALL, this \overline{f} day of $\overline{\int u/y}$, 1999

12